

James O. Lattner  
EDELMAN, COMBS, LATTNER & GOODWIN, LLC  
120 South LaSalle Street, 18th Floor  
Chicago, Illinois 60603  
(312) 739-4200 (telephone)  
(312) 419-0379 (facsimile)  
jlattner@edcombs.com

Ethan Preston (263295)  
PRESTON LAW OFFICES  
8245 North 85th Way  
Scottsdale, Arizona 85258  
(480) 269-9540 (telephone)  
(866) 509-1197 (facsimile)  
ep@eplaw.us

Douglas J. Campion (75381)  
LAW OFFICES OF DOUGLAS J. CAMPION  
409 Camino Del Rio South, Suite 303  
San Diego, California 92108  
(619) 299-2091 (telephone)  
(619) 858-0034 (facsimile)  
[doug@djcampion.com](mailto:doug@djcampion.com)

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR  
THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

IN RE PORTFOLIO RECOVERY  
ASSOCIATES, LLC, TELEPHONE  
CONSUMER PROTECTION ACT  
LITIGATION

No. 11-md-02295-JAH-BGS

Hon. John A. Houston  
Hon. Bernard G. Skomal

THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO:  
3:11-cv-03007-JAH-BGS  
3:11-cv-03006-JAH-BGS

**PLAINTIFFS FRYDMAN, MARIN,  
JURY, MEYER, AND ALLEN'S  
RESPONSE TO PLAINTIFFS  
BARTLETT AND HARVEY'S  
CONSOLIDATED MOTION FOR  
STANDING TO ACTIVELY  
PARTICIPATE IN SETTLEMENT  
CONFERENCE**

1 Plaintiffs Jeremy Frydman, Sam Marin, Jesse Meyer, Fred Jury, and Danny Allen  
 2 (“Nationwide Plaintiffs”) hereby respectfully submit their response (“Response”) to Plaintiffs  
 3 Kimberly Bartlett and Karen Harvey’s (“Carve-Out Plaintiffs”) Consolidated Motion for Standing to  
 4 Actively Participate in Settlement Conference Scheduled for May 8, 2013 Pursuant to the Order of  
 5 Honorable Bernard G. Skomal (“Bartlett and Harvey motion”). (Dkt. No. 87).

6 Nationwide Plaintiffs, by lead counsel, do not object to the presence of Henry Turner at  
 7 the settlement conference, but object to any attempt by Mr. Turner to establish subclasses.

8 There are no subclasses in this MDL proceeding. While Bartlett and Harvey have  
 9 repeatedly attempted to have subclasses established, those efforts have been rejected three times,  
 10 once by the MDL panel, and twice by Judge Houston. (Dkt. Nos. 18 and 35).

11 Bartlett and Harvey want a narrower class than the nationwide class, but they seek no  
 12 additional relief for that class. The factors cited by Bartlett and Harvey (the residence the  
 13 putative subclasses, and the age of the debt with respect to the statute of limitations) are not  
 14 material because they have no bearing on either liability or relief. The restriction to those  
 15 persons who phone numbers have been skip-traced is not material because it is subsumed in the  
 16 Nationwide Class definition – the class definition in the Amended Consolidated Complaint  
 17 specifically includes in the class all persons for whom that defendants:

18 fail to produce records (or other evidence) that such person provided such cellular  
 19 telephone number to Defendants or the original creditor (including, for example,  
 where the number was obtained through skip tracing or captured by the  
 20 Defendants’ equipment from an inbound call).

21 There is no reason to differentiate skip traced persons from those whose number was obtained by  
 22 capture from an inbound call or obtained by any other means. Because Bartlett and Harvey have  
 23 failed to show how these distinctions have any legal significance to the TCPA claims at issue,  
 24 the subclasses they have proposed are not appropriate. *Cf. Clark Equipment Co. v. Int'l Union,*  
*Allied Indus. Workers of America, AFL-CIO*, 803 F.2d 878, 880 (6th Cir. 1986) (subclassing is  
 25 “appropriate only when the court believes it will materially improve the litigation” because it  
 26 “often leads to more complex and protracted litigation,” citing *Mendoza v. United States*, 623  
 27 F.2d 1338 (9th Cir. 1980)); *White v. Experian Info. Solutions, Inc.*, 803 F. Supp. 2d 1086, 1109  
 28

1 (C.D. Cal. 2011) (“not every distinction among groups of class members gives rise the existence  
 2 of a subclass”; quoting *Shaffer v. Continental Cas. Co.*, 362 Fed. Appx. 627, 630-31 (9th Cir.  
 3 2010) for proposition that ““the fact that it is possible to draw a line between categories of class  
 4 members’ does not necessarily mean that subclasses exist for the purposes of an *Amchem*  
 5 analysis”)).

6 Lead counsel has been designated by the Court to represent all purported class members  
 7 at this stage of the proceedings. After reflection, lead counsel do not object to Mr. Henry’s  
 8 attendance at the settlement conference, but we do object to his active participation in the  
 9 conference if Mr. Henry intends to use the settlement conference as a platform to renew his quest  
 10 to establish subclasses. Lead counsel seek to obtain a settlement for the entire class, but  
 11 recognize that the negotiations will be difficult and lengthy under any circumstances. Any  
 12 amount of time spent discussing previously rejected subclasses will be counterproductive.

13 Dated: April 11, 2013

14 By: s/James O. Lattner

15 James O. Lattner  
 16 EDELMAN, COMBS, LATTNER &  
 17 GOODWIN, LLC  
 18 120 South LaSalle Street, 18th Floor  
 19 Chicago, Illinois 60603  
 (312) 739-4200 (telephone)  
 (312) 419-0379 (facsimile)  
 dedelman@edcombs.com  
 ccombs@edcombs.com  
 jlattner@edcombs.com  
 fgreen@edcombs.com

20 Ethan Preston (263295)  
 21 PRESTON LAW OFFICES  
 22 8245 North 85th Way  
 23 Scottsdale, Arizona 85258  
 (480) 269-9540 (telephone)  
 (866) 509-1197 (facsimile)  
 ep@eplaw.us

24 Douglas J. Campion (75381)  
 25 LAW OFFICES OF DOUGLAS J. CAMPION  
 26 409 Camino Del Rio South, Suite 303  
 27 San Diego, California 92108  
 (619) 299-2091 (telephone)  
 (619) 858-0034 (facsimile)  
 doug@djcampion.com

28 *Co-Lead Counsel and Liaison Counsel for Plaintiffs*

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1746, I hereby certify that I served the foregoing document and this Certificate of Service upon the parties listed below by causing the foregoing document to be transmitted to the Electronic Filing System in the manner prescribed by the Court's Administrative Policies and Procedures Manual on the date below:

Christopher William Madel  
Barry M. Landy  
Denise S. Rahne  
Jennifer M. Robbins  
Nicole S Frank  
Robins, Kaplan, Miller & Ciresi  
L.L.P.  
2800 LaSalle Plaza  
800 LaSalle Avenue  
Minneapolis, Minnesota 55402-2015  
(612) 349-8500 (telephone)  
(612) 339-4181 (facsimile)  
[cwmadel@rkmc.com](mailto:cwmadel@rkmc.com)  
[bmlandy@rkmc.com](mailto:bmlandy@rkmc.com)  
[dsrahne@rkmc.com](mailto:dsrahne@rkmc.com)  
[jmrobbins@rkmc.com](mailto:jmrobbins@rkmc.com)  
[nsfrank@rkmc.com](mailto:nsfrank@rkmc.com)

Henry A. Turner  
Turner Law Offices, LLC  
403 W Ponce de Leon Avenue, Suite 207  
Decatur, Georgia 30030  
(404) 261-7787 (telephone)  
(404) 377-1053 (facsimile)  
hturner@tloffices.com

Samuel M. Hill  
The Law Offices of Sam Hill, LLC  
265 Riverchase Parkway East, Suite 202  
Hoover, Alabama 35244  
205-250-7776 (telephone)  
[sam@samhilllawofcs.com](mailto:sam@samhilllawofcs.com)

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Kimberly Bartlett, on her own behalf, and behalf of all others similarly situated*

Julia Veronica Lee  
Robins Miller Kaplan & Ciresi LLP  
2049 Century Park East, Suite 3400  
Los Angeles, California 90067  
(310) 552-0130 (telephone)  
(310) 229-5800 (facsimile)  
jvlee@rkmc.com

Henry A. Turner  
Turner Law Offices, LLC  
403 W Ponce de Leon Avenue, Suite 207  
Decatur, Georgia 30030  
(404) 261-7787 (telephone)  
(404) 377-1053 (facsimile)  
hturner@tloffices.com

Lawrence A. Farese  
Robins, Kaplan, Miller & Ciresi, LLP  
711 5th Ave S, Suite 201  
Naples, Florida 34102  
(239) 213-1973 (telephone)  
(239) 213-1970 (facsimile)  
lafarese@rkmc.com

Mauricio Arcadier  
Arcadier & Associates, PA,  
2815 West New Haven Avenue, Suite 304  
West Melbourne, Florida 32904  
(321) 953-5998 (telephone)  
(321) 953-6075 (facsimile)  
[office@wamalaw.com](mailto:office@wamalaw.com)

Lisa Lorraine Heller  
Robins Kaplan Miller & Ciresi LLP  
One Atlantic Center  
1201 West Peachtree Street, Suite  
2200  
Atlanta, GA 30309-3453  
(404) 760-4300 (telephone)  
(404) 233-1267 (facsimile)  
llheller@rkmc.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Karen Harvey, on her own behalf,  
and behalf of all others  
similarly situated*

Ethan Preston (263295)  
PRESTON LAW OFFICES  
8245 North 85th Way  
Scottsdale, Arizona 85258  
(480) 269-9540 (telephone)

1 Barbara Fernandez  
2 David Palmer Hartnett  
3 Hinshaw & Culbertson LLP  
4 9155 S Dadeland Boulevard  
5 Suite 1600  
6 Miami, FL 33156-2741  
7 305-358-7747  
8 Fax: 305-577-1063  
9 bfernandez@hinshawlaw.com

10 Nathan L. Horton  
11 Portfolio Recovery Associates, LLC  
12 P O Box 41113  
13 Nashville, TN 37204  
14 (888) 772-7326 x. 18396  
15 Fax: (757) 518-0860  
16 nhorton@portfoliorecovery.com

17 *Attorneys for Defendant Portfolio  
18 Recovery  
19 Associates, LLC*

20 Alexander S. Vesselinovitch  
21 Emily J Prentice  
22 Katten Muchin Rosenman LLP  
23 525 West Monroe Street  
24 Chicago, Illinois 60661  
25 (312) 902-5200 (telephone)  
26 avesselinovitch@kattenlaw.com  
emily.prentice@kattenlaw.com

27 Robert E. Sickles  
28 Hinshaw & Culbertson, LLP  
100 South Ashley Drive, Suite 500  
Tampa, Florida 33602  
(813) 868-8838 (telephone)  
(813) 276-1956 (facsimile)  
rsickles@hinshawlaw.com

29 *Attorneys for Defendant Portfolio  
Recovery  
Associates, LLC*

30 Douglas J. Campion (75381)  
31 LAW OFFICES OF DOUGLAS J.  
32 CAMPION  
33 409 Camino Del Rio South, Suite 303  
34 San Diego, California 92108  
35 (619) 299-2091 (telephone)  
36 (619) 858-0034 (facsimile)  
37 doug@djcampion.com

38 Abbas Kazerounian  
Kazerounian Law Group  
2700 North Main Street, Suite 1000

39 (866) 509-1197 (facsimile)  
40 ep@eplaw.us  
41  
42 David C. Parisi  
43 Suzanne Havens Beckman  
44 Azita Moradmand  
45 Parisi & Havens LLP  
46 15233 Valleyheart Drive  
47 Sherman Oaks, California 91403  
48 (818) 990-1299 (telephone)  
49 (818) 501-7852 (facsimile)  
50 dparisi@parisihavens.com  
amoradmand@parisihavens.com  
shavens@parisihavens.com

51 *Attorneys for Plaintiff Jesse Meyer, on his  
52 own behalf, and behalf of all others  
53 similarly situated*

54 Daniel A Edelman  
55 Cathleen M. Combs  
56 James O. Lattner  
57 Francis R. Greene  
58 Edelman, Combs, Lattner & Goodwin, LLC  
59 120 South LaSalle Street, 18th Floor  
60 Chicago, Illinois 60603  
61 (312) 739-4200 (telephone)  
62 (312) 419-0379 (facsimile)  
63 dedelman@edcombs.com  
ccombs@edcombs.com  
jlattner@edcombs.com  
fgreen@edcombs.com

64 Keith James Keogh  
65 Craig M. Shapiro  
66 Timothy J. Sostrin  
67 Keogh Law, Ltd.  
68 101 North Wacker Drive, Suite 605  
69 Chicago, Illinois 60606  
70 (312) 726-1092 (telephone)  
71 (312) 726-1093 (facsimile)  
72 Keith@Keoghlaw.com  
cshapiro@keoghlaw.com  
tsostrin@keoghlaw.com

73 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs Jeremy Frydman and Sam  
74 Marin, on their own behalf, and behalf of all others  
75 similarly situated*

76 Paul K. Guibao  
77 Weisberg & Meyers, LLC  
78 1448 Madison Avenue  
79 Memphis, TN 38104  
80 (602) 445-9819  
81 pguibao@attorneysforconsumers.com

1 Santa Ana, California 92866  
2 (800) 400-6808 (telephone)  
3 (800) 520-5523 (facsimile)  
4 ak@kazlg.com

5 *Attorney for Plaintiffs Kenneth McCormick and Janet*  
6 *McCormick*

7 Joshua Swigart  
8 Hyde & Swigart  
9 411 Camino Del Rio South, Suite 301  
10 San Diego, California 92108  
11 (619) 233-7770 (telephone)  
12 (619) 297-1022 (facsimile)  
13 josh@westcoastlitigation.com

14 Scott David Owens  
15 664 E. Hallandale Beach Blvd.  
16 Hallandale, FL 33009  
17 954-589-0588  
18 Fax: 954-337-0666  
19 scott@scottdowens.com

20 *Attorney for Plaintiffs Christine Suarez and Carlos*  
21 *Suarez*

22 *Attorneys for Plaintiff Danny Allen,*  
23 *Jr., on his own behalf, and behalf of*  
24 *all others similarly situated*

25 Dated: April 11, 2012

26 By: s/ James O. Lattner  
27 James O. Lattner  
28 EDELMAN, COMBS, LATTNER &  
1 GOODWIN, LLC  
2 120 South LaSalle Street, 18th Floor  
3 Chicago, Illinois 60603  
4 (312) 739-4200 (telephone)  
5 (312) 419-0379 (facsimile)  
6 dedelman@edcombs.com  
7 ccombs@edcombs.com  
8 jlattner@edcombs.com  
9 fgreen@edcombs.com